

-
- (5) An extended substance is defined as three-dimensional, with shape and motion: "... I distinctly imagine the extension of the quantity (or rather of the thing which is quantified) in length, breadth, and depth. I also enumerate various parts of the thing, and to these parts I assign various sizes, shapes, positions and local motions; and to these motions I assign various durations." (p. 44)
- (6) The body, as an extended substance, also has the property of exclusionary occupation of space: "... by body I understand whatever has a determinable shape and a definable location and can occupy space in such a way as to exclude any other body" (p. 17)
- (7) Mind and body differ further in that the former is indivisible and the latter divisible: "... the body is by its very nature always divisible, while the mind is utterly indivisible." (p. 59)
-

1
00:00:09,230 --> 00:00:05,780

I might as well get started

2
00:00:10,759 --> 00:00:09,240

I am Kenny Arnett and I currently am an

3
00:00:13,640 --> 00:00:10,769

assistant professor of psychology at

4
00:00:15,950 --> 00:00:13,650

Southern Oregon University but this is

5
00:00:20,240 --> 00:00:15,960

my second incarnation I was previously a

6
00:00:22,040 --> 00:00:20,250

physical chemist and I am embarking on a

7
00:00:23,900 --> 00:00:22,050

third incarnation soon I will no longer

8
00:00:29,089 --> 00:00:23,910

be a psychologist I'll be a rugged

9
00:00:30,800 --> 00:00:29,099

consciousness researcher so I think I'm

10
00:00:38,319 --> 00:00:30,810

in the right place for that but we're

11
00:00:44,150 --> 00:00:40,600

my interests are in consciousness

12
00:00:46,000 --> 00:00:44,160

obviously pulling together my background

13
00:00:49,100 --> 00:00:46,010

in chemistry physics mathematics

14

00:00:51,590 --> 00:00:49,110

psychology philosophy and trying to make

15

00:00:54,170 --> 00:00:51,600

a nice soup of it all and try to come

16

00:00:55,959 --> 00:00:54,180

out with some answers that at least I

17

00:00:58,939 --> 00:00:55,969

can pretend to understand at some point

18

00:01:01,760 --> 00:00:58,949

so today I'd like to give you just a

19

00:01:05,149 --> 00:01:01,770

small piece of my work and a very recent

20

00:01:08,810 --> 00:01:05,159

extension of it that attempts to come

21

00:01:11,840 --> 00:01:08,820

close to answering Klaus question a

22

00:01:13,310 --> 00:01:11,850

couple of days ago do we have any basis

23

00:01:14,539 --> 00:01:13,320

for believing that consciousness could

24

00:01:16,789 --> 00:01:14,549

exist outside of the body

25

00:01:19,100 --> 00:01:16,799

he said that we currently don't have

26

00:01:20,600 --> 00:01:19,110

such a basis I would like to give you

27

00:01:26,260 --> 00:01:20,610

some ideas that might provide such a

28

00:01:52,280 --> 00:01:26,270

basis if I could be so presumptuous and

29

00:01:55,219 --> 00:01:52,290

the computer seems to be set up okay

30

00:01:58,340 --> 00:01:55,229

please forgive the primitive nature of

31

00:01:59,959 --> 00:01:58,350

my presentation technology this is poor

32

00:02:04,069 --> 00:01:59,969

persons PowerPoint otherwise known as

33

00:02:05,810 --> 00:02:04,079

word and you see my affiliation and the

34

00:02:08,119 --> 00:02:05,820

title of my talk philosophical

35

00:02:11,089 --> 00:02:08,129

substance-abuse distorting Descartes and

36

00:02:12,440 --> 00:02:11,099

dismissing dualism I'm going to try to

37

00:02:14,960 --> 00:02:12,450

come to the defense of Rene Descartes

38

00:02:16,490 --> 00:02:14,970

and we learned recently that I may be

39

00:02:22,960 --> 00:02:16,500

able to make him feel better in his time

40

00:02:26,479 --> 00:02:22,970

by going backwards myself so

41

00:02:30,979 --> 00:02:26,489

consciousness what is it we don't really

42

00:02:33,589 --> 00:02:30,989

know and yet we all have it the

43

00:02:35,780 --> 00:02:33,599

mind-body problem what is that well

44

00:02:37,009 --> 00:02:35,790

that's deeply related to the question of

45

00:02:38,990 --> 00:02:37,019

what is consciousness and where does

46

00:02:40,940 --> 00:02:39,000

consciousness originate the mind-body

47

00:02:43,040 --> 00:02:40,950

problem is the question of what is the

48

00:02:46,100 --> 00:02:43,050

relationship between mind and body does

49

00:02:48,160 --> 00:02:46,110

body create mind or is there something

50

00:02:50,960 --> 00:02:48,170

else going on and two of the major

51
00:02:54,040 --> 00:02:50,970
historical points of view our first

52
00:02:57,320 --> 00:02:54,050
dualism the idea that in mind is primary

53
00:02:59,690 --> 00:02:57,330
independent not physical and does not

54
00:03:02,720 --> 00:02:59,700
die with the body and does not depend on

55
00:03:05,050 --> 00:03:02,730
the body for its existence this was the

56
00:03:07,190 --> 00:03:05,060
predominant view of philosophers and

57
00:03:09,710 --> 00:03:07,200
everybody on the planet for a very long

58
00:03:13,490 --> 00:03:09,720
time according to popular and Eccles but

59
00:03:15,949 --> 00:03:13,500
as scientists began to construct the

60
00:03:19,449 --> 00:03:15,959
scientific method and science advanced

61
00:03:24,290 --> 00:03:19,459
over time dualism started to lose its

62
00:03:26,270 --> 00:03:24,300
respect and in fact ironically it was

63
00:03:29,149 --> 00:03:26,280

Rene Descartes that helped lead to the

64
00:03:33,259 --> 00:03:29,159
demise of dualism even though he was one

65
00:03:34,820 --> 00:03:33,269
of its primary proponents the idea that

66
00:03:37,039 --> 00:03:34,830
rod rose instead of dualism was

67
00:03:38,899 --> 00:03:37,049
materialism which an earlier speaker

68
00:03:40,699 --> 00:03:38,909
called physicalism and that's really

69
00:03:42,470 --> 00:03:40,709
essentially the same thing the idea that

70
00:03:44,570 --> 00:03:42,480
the mind is a product of the living

71
00:03:48,110 --> 00:03:44,580
brain and ceases to exist when the brain

72
00:03:48,770 --> 00:03:48,120
meets its death dualism in philosophical

73
00:03:51,160 --> 00:03:48,780
and

74
00:03:54,440 --> 00:03:51,170
psychological service circles has been

75
00:03:58,100 --> 00:03:54,450
beaten to death and buried it no longer

76
00:04:02,630 --> 00:03:58,110
is viable it is over anyone who believes

77
00:04:07,449 --> 00:04:02,640
in dualism that best is diluted and so

78
00:04:13,309 --> 00:04:10,490
that carts view of substance from his

79
00:04:14,690 --> 00:04:13,319
meditations on First Philosophy this is

80
00:04:17,479 --> 00:04:14,700
something that I think the physicalist

81
00:04:19,670 --> 00:04:17,489
should read so that they know what it is

82
00:04:22,550 --> 00:04:19,680
they're denying and denouncing before

83
00:04:26,600 --> 00:04:22,560
they do it Rene Descartes had several

84
00:04:29,270 --> 00:04:26,610
ideas had in his idea his mind trying to

85
00:04:32,030 --> 00:04:29,280
distinguish between mind and body

86
00:04:34,850 --> 00:04:32,040
he said that both mind and body are

87
00:04:36,440 --> 00:04:34,860
substances what is the substance it's a

88
00:04:38,450 --> 00:04:36,450

thing that's capable of existing

89

00:04:40,280 --> 00:04:38,460

independently I found that a rather

90

00:04:43,909 --> 00:04:40,290

oblique definition when I first started

91

00:04:45,290 --> 00:04:43,919

studying this but lately I started to

92

00:04:47,930 --> 00:04:45,300

understand when I heard some ideas about

93

00:04:50,060 --> 00:04:47,940

from Aristotle an example of a non

94

00:04:52,180 --> 00:04:50,070

substance would be a shadow a shadow

95

00:04:54,560 --> 00:04:52,190

requires a source of light and an object

96

00:04:56,690 --> 00:04:54,570

it does not exist independently it

97

00:04:58,370 --> 00:04:56,700

cannot exist without those things but

98

00:05:01,250 --> 00:04:58,380

the source of light and the object can't

99

00:05:02,990 --> 00:05:01,260

exist without the shadow and can't exist

100

00:05:06,469 --> 00:05:03,000

independently so they would be made of a

101
00:05:08,960 --> 00:05:06,479
substance third Descartes said that the

102
00:05:10,850 --> 00:05:08,970
mind is a thinking and non extended

103
00:05:13,390 --> 00:05:10,860
substance and here's where he started to

104
00:05:16,070 --> 00:05:13,400
get into trouble with his third sentence

105
00:05:18,440 --> 00:05:16,080
whereas the body is non thinking and

106
00:05:20,690 --> 00:05:18,450
extended what did he mean by extension

107
00:05:22,490 --> 00:05:20,700
well it's rather complicated I don't

108
00:05:24,469 --> 00:05:22,500
have the time to stand here and read all

109
00:05:27,050 --> 00:05:24,479
the quotes that I provide I'm hoping

110
00:05:29,060 --> 00:05:27,060
that you're scanning those as I talk but

111
00:05:32,120 --> 00:05:29,070
his idea of extension included the idea

112
00:05:35,360 --> 00:05:32,130
that two things with extension cannot

113
00:05:37,610 --> 00:05:35,370

occupy the same physical space that is

114

00:05:40,340 --> 00:05:37,620

the exclusionary occupation of space by

115

00:05:44,029 --> 00:05:40,350

matter which is a well-known principle

116

00:05:45,620 --> 00:05:44,039

in physics and accordingly he said it is

117

00:05:47,900 --> 00:05:45,630

certain that I am really distinct from

118

00:05:49,640 --> 00:05:47,910

my body and can exist without it and

119

00:05:54,340 --> 00:05:49,650

that's a point-blank statement of

120

00:05:57,740 --> 00:05:54,350

dualism v he defined an extended

121

00:06:00,800 --> 00:05:57,750

substances having three dimensions with

122

00:06:02,460 --> 00:06:00,810

shape and motion the body as an extended

123

00:06:04,770 --> 00:06:02,470

substance also has the property of the

124

00:06:07,890 --> 00:06:04,780

seclusion area occupation of space as I

125

00:06:11,580 --> 00:06:07,900

was just saying seventh mind and body

126

00:06:14,070 --> 00:06:11,590

differ further in that body is divisible

127

00:06:16,860 --> 00:06:14,080

physically it can be cut apart whereas

128

00:06:19,350 --> 00:06:16,870

mind he says is utterly indivisible and

129

00:06:24,500 --> 00:06:19,360

by that he means with physical means

130

00:06:27,210 --> 00:06:24,510

like knives or whatever and then lastly

131

00:06:29,250 --> 00:06:27,220

the human body is an interactive union

132

00:06:30,810 --> 00:06:29,260

of mind and body and here's another

133

00:06:32,880 --> 00:06:30,820

place he got himself in trouble because

134

00:06:36,000 --> 00:06:32,890

he could not explain how the interaction

135

00:06:38,700 --> 00:06:36,010

occurs and this above all else has been

136

00:06:45,000 --> 00:06:38,710

cited as a reason why it's obvious the

137

00:06:47,610 --> 00:06:45,010

dualism is false so objections there are

138

00:06:49,080 --> 00:06:47,620

many I just picked one because it's the

139

00:06:51,630 --> 00:06:49,090

usual objection and it's what I just

140

00:06:53,670 --> 00:06:51,640

stated if the brain is physical and the

141

00:06:56,430 --> 00:06:53,680

mind is non-physical then how can the

142

00:06:59,430 --> 00:06:56,440

brain and the mind interact this is

143

00:07:00,840 --> 00:06:59,440

posed as a rhetorical question a

144

00:07:03,390 --> 00:07:00,850

question would the answer already

145

00:07:05,940 --> 00:07:03,400

incorporate it into it by using the term

146

00:07:08,340 --> 00:07:05,950

non-physical this way the person asking

147

00:07:12,240 --> 00:07:08,350

such a question is implicitly defining a

148

00:07:13,650 --> 00:07:12,250

non-physical entity as not able to

149

00:07:15,690 --> 00:07:13,660

interact with a physical entity that's

150

00:07:18,060 --> 00:07:15,700

what makes it non-physical and so the

151
00:07:19,409 --> 00:07:18,070
question contains the answer and we're

152
00:07:22,200 --> 00:07:19,419
supposed to say oh you're right it's

153
00:07:25,890 --> 00:07:22,210
over there is no interactionism there is

154
00:07:29,340 --> 00:07:25,900
no duality there is no dualism well

155
00:07:32,940 --> 00:07:29,350
that's a bit of taking Descartes too far

156
00:07:36,420 --> 00:07:32,950
in my opinion and materialists have been

157
00:07:38,850 --> 00:07:36,430
at this for centuries picking on foreign

158
00:07:40,590 --> 00:07:38,860
aid the card and he they have

159
00:07:42,360 --> 00:07:40,600
exaggerated and sharpened the other

160
00:07:44,940 --> 00:07:42,370
distinctions that he made into a

161
00:07:46,409 --> 00:07:44,950
description of the non-physical

162
00:07:48,719 --> 00:07:46,419
substance as something that's really

163
00:07:50,159 --> 00:07:48,729

untenable the non-physical mind has

164

00:07:52,740 --> 00:07:50,169

neither mass nor energy is not

165

00:07:54,659 --> 00:07:52,750

localizable in any way and space is not

166

00:07:56,430 --> 00:07:54,669

extended in space does not exist in

167

00:07:58,050 --> 00:07:56,440

space has no physical properties

168

00:07:59,760 --> 00:07:58,060

whatsoever has nothing in common with

169

00:08:01,260 --> 00:07:59,770

physical things and is completely

170

00:08:02,850 --> 00:08:01,270

independent of anything material and

171

00:08:06,360 --> 00:08:02,860

works in different independently of the

172

00:08:09,810 --> 00:08:06,370

brain okay that's too much they've gone

173

00:08:11,430 --> 00:08:09,820

over the ledge here and to tell an

174

00:08:13,230 --> 00:08:11,440

interactionist that his point of view is

175

00:08:15,510 --> 00:08:13,240

that the mind works independently of the

176

00:08:16,740 --> 00:08:15,520

brain is to not listen when the guy says

177

00:08:19,370 --> 00:08:16,750

I'm an inner

178

00:08:22,800 --> 00:08:19,380

so no this is not what Descartes thought

179

00:08:26,850 --> 00:08:22,810

however it's become the way he's

180

00:08:28,590 --> 00:08:26,860

described my objection if the body and

181

00:08:30,420 --> 00:08:28,600

the mind both fit the definition of

182

00:08:33,120 --> 00:08:30,430

substance according to Descartes who

183

00:08:36,329 --> 00:08:33,130

coined the term to describe things that

184

00:08:38,490 --> 00:08:36,339

are substantial then these two examples

185

00:08:40,230 --> 00:08:38,500

of substances must share some common

186

00:08:41,490 --> 00:08:40,240

properties that is the definition of

187

00:08:44,250 --> 00:08:41,500

substance they both have to meet that

188

00:08:46,350 --> 00:08:44,260

definition and this point seems to us

189

00:08:48,660 --> 00:08:46,360

have escaped the physicalist materialist

190

00:08:50,850 --> 00:08:48,670

thinks so how do we gain traction on

191

00:08:53,790 --> 00:08:50,860

such a slippery problem how do we

192

00:08:56,730 --> 00:08:53,800

approach the idea and and generate some

193

00:08:58,410 --> 00:08:56,740

ideas about what exactly could another

194

00:09:02,010 --> 00:08:58,420

sub size matter

195

00:09:04,380 --> 00:09:02,020

be and mean so we need some empirical

196

00:09:06,960 --> 00:09:04,390

data and we also need some theoretical

197

00:09:09,329 --> 00:09:06,970

help and I'm going to ask Albert

198

00:09:11,040 --> 00:09:09,339

Einstein for help today and I'm going

199

00:09:14,160 --> 00:09:11,050

through with apologies ask Brian Greene

200

00:09:16,769 --> 00:09:14,170

for some help he was here last weekend

201
00:09:19,530 --> 00:09:16,779
for the ice cream conference and he was

202
00:09:24,180 --> 00:09:19,540
shall we say not exactly intrigued by my

203
00:09:26,310 --> 00:09:24,190
ideas and so I apologize to him here my

204
00:09:29,070 --> 00:09:26,320
invoking him in this talk if he were

205
00:09:38,820 --> 00:09:29,080
here he would be outraged and I'm sorry

206
00:09:41,190 --> 00:09:38,830
he's not here what do I call empirical

207
00:09:44,210 --> 00:09:41,200
data here's where I get myself in even

208
00:09:46,320 --> 00:09:44,220
more trouble the near-death experience

209
00:09:51,240 --> 00:09:46,330
most of you have probably heard of this

210
00:09:52,800 --> 00:09:51,250
this occurs usually when a person comes

211
00:09:54,560 --> 00:09:52,810
close to physical death or actually

212
00:09:57,180 --> 00:09:54,570
physically dies and this isn't